United Nations

Committee of Experts on Public Administration

Report on the tenth session (4-8 April 2011)

Economic and Social Council
Official Records, 2011
Supplement No. 24

Economic and Social Council
Official Records, 2011
Supplement No. 24

Committee of Experts on Public Administration

Report on the tenth session (4-8 April 2011)

United Nations • New York, 2011

Note

Symbols of United Nations documents are composed of capital letters combined with figures. Mention of such a symbol indicates a reference to a United Nations document.

ISSN 1728-0036

Summary

The present report contains the summary and recommendations of the tenth session of the Committee of Experts on Public Administration, held at United Nations Headquarters from 4 to 8 April 2011. The Committee, which was established by the Economic and Social Council in its resolution 2001/45, consists of 24 experts appointed in their personal capacity for a four-year period. The Committee dealt with the following substantive items: (a) public governance for results to improve the quality of life for all, in post-conflict and post-disaster countries, and in social protection policies for vulnerable populations; (b) performance management in governance in relation to internationally agreed development goals and commitments, in particular in regard to education, the theme of the 2011 annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council; and (c) review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance.

Contents

Chapter		*Page*
I.	Draft resolution recommended for adoption by the Economic and Social Council	1
II.	Organization of the session	5
	A. Duration of the session	5
	B. Attendance	5
	C. Agenda	5
	D. Election of officers	6
III.	Summary of proceedings and conclusions	7
	A. Work of the Committee	7
	B. Public governance for results	8
	C. Performance management in governance, including in relation to the theme of the annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council: implementing the internationally agreed goals and commitments in regard to education	14
	D. Review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance	16
	E. Session on innovative ways to enrich collaboration between the Committee of Experts and the Division	18
	F. Proposed programme of work and agenda for the next session of the Committee of Experts and preliminary review of the draft report of the Committee	20
Annex		
	List of documents	21

Chapter I

Draft resolution recommended for adoption by the Economic and Social Council

The Committee of Experts on Public Administration recommends to the Economic and Social Council the adoption of the following draft resolution:

Report of the Committee of Experts on Public Administration on its tenth session

The Economic and Social Council,

Recalling its resolutions 2002/40 of 19 December 2002, 2003/60 of 25 July 2003, 2005/3 of 31 March 2005, 2005/55 of 21 October 2005, 2006/47 of 28 July 2006, 2007/38 of 4 October 2007, 2008/32 of 25 July 2008 and 2009/18 of 29 July 2009, all on public administration and development, and 2010/2 of 19 July 2010, on enhanced cooperation on international public policies pertaining to the Internet,

Referring to General Assembly resolutions 50/225 of 19 April 1996, 56/213 of 21 December 2001, 57/277 of 20 December 2002, 58/231 of 23 December 2003, 59/55 of 2 December 2004 and 60/34 of 30 November 2005, all on public administration and development, and resolutions 63/202 of 19 December 2008, 64/187 of 21 December 2009 and 65/141 of 20 December 2010, on information and communications technologies for development,

Recognizing the work of the Committee of Experts on Public Administration in providing policy advice and programmatic guidance to the Economic and Social Council on issues related to governance and public administration in development,

Taking note of the support being provided by the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance to countries on institutional and human-resource capacity, development management, electronic and mobile government development, and citizen engagement in the public sector,

Underscoring the role of public administration in ensuring sustainable growth and social and economic development for peace and political stability, particularly in countries emerging from conflict,

Underscoring also the role of public administration for the mitigation, preparedness, response and recovery from disasters due to the unfolding environmental crises globally, in particular with regard to adaptation to climate change in the least developed countries, small island developing States and other highly impacted regions,

Underscoring further the role of public administration in providing public security and social protection for vulnerable populations, in order to reduce social inequality, including gender inequality, and prevent social unrest, in achieving the internationally agreed development goals, including the Millennium Development Goals,

Underscoring the role of professional public administration in the effectiveness and accountability of public sector performance,

1. *Takes note* of the recommendations contained in the report of the Committee of Experts on Public Administration at its tenth session[1] on public governance for results to improve the quality of human life for all;

2. *Takes note* of the recommendations contained in the report of the Committee of Experts on Public Administration at its tenth session on post-conflict and post-disaster situations, social protection, performance management in governance for socially relevant results, empowering citizens, and promoting quality civic education, including in relation to implementing the internationally agreed development goals and commitments in regard to education, the theme of the 2011 annual ministerial review of the Council;

3. *Welcomes* the focus of the Committee on "Local public governance and administration for results: how local public administration should be improved to support the implementation of the internationally agreed development agenda, including the Millennium Development Goals" as the theme of its eleventh session, in 2012;

4. *Underscores* that national consensus and civic management as well as professionalism in the implementation of national policies and programmes within prescribed rules and regulations, under effective national, local, and public administration leadership, are vital in general and in particular for post-disaster rehabilitation and post-conflict development;

5. *Takes note* of the conclusions of the Committee on the need for continual capacity-building for development in the areas of public administration through advocacy, needs analysis, analytical research, sharing of what works, advisory services, evaluation services, and online and offline training, at the national and subnational levels;

6. *Takes note* of the recommendation of the Committee that the Economic and Social Council build on the internationally agreed goals, the Millennium Development Goals, after 2015, by fashioning a global agenda on social protection, especially for vulnerable populations and new categories of exclusion, and a closer link with the development agenda;

7. *Takes note* also of the continuing impact of the financial and economic crisis on efforts to achieve the Millennium Development Goals and the recommendation of the Committee that the Economic and Social Council advise Member States to prepare for the need of continued extraordinary financial and technical assistance in support of the Millennium Development Goals beyond 2015;

8. *Takes note* of the challenges from climate change for public administration in meeting the internationally agreed goals, especially areas of food security and social protection in poor countries, and the recommendation of the Committee that the Economic and Social Council advise countries of the need for immediate, new, and additional financial and technical assistance to affected countries to preclude the loss of economic and social advances in recent years and avoid social breakdown;

9. *Takes note* of the necessity for independent information in evaluations of public results and the recommendation of the Committee that the United Nations has

[1] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2011, Supplement No. 24* (E/2011/24).

the capacity and legitimacy to provide such information, such as on the Millennium Development Goals;

10. *Appreciates* the discussions and work undertaken by the United Nations concerning vulnerability alert systems, including the United Nations Global Pulse;

11. *Requests* the Secretariat to:

(a) Support further development of the United Nation Public Administration Network for partnership-building, knowledge dissemination, and the exchange of knowledge and learning experiences from what works, when, and why and what does not;

(b) Continue its facilitation of knowledge-creation and sharing through its United Nations Public Administration Country Studies;

(c) Continue to develop an active knowledge repository, as part of the United Nations Public Administration Country Studies, which contains analytical and case studies, guidelines, and other knowledge-sharing outputs on what works, when, and why in governance for development, particularly in post-conflict countries and countries that face the cumulative effects of successive disasters, and with due regard to differences among developed, developing, and poorest countries;

(d) Create an online e-platform register, as part of the United Nations Public Administration Country Studies, which contains social protection programmes in countries;

(e) Better promote and utilize innovative public sector initiatives by Member States;

(f) Better publicize the opportunity of the United Nations Public Service Awards, disseminate information on good practices and innovation from the awards, and use the case studies in capacity-building and training activities, inviting countries to use what works according to their social and economic context, and assess the impact of these case studies;

(g) Give priority to training the highest quality senior managers and top civil servants in human resource development;

(h) Continue to enhance its support for capacity-building in the public sector within existing resources;

(i) Continue to assist in analysis, policy options, and capacity-building for post-conflict countries, particularly on their governance capacities for development and for negotiating with the large number of external actors engaged in post-conflict reconstruction;

(j) Continue to provide countries in post-disaster situations with policy advice, capacity-building actions, and tools for engaging citizens, civil society organizations, and the private sector in recovery and reconstruction efforts, deepening public accountability, and preventing corruption;

(k) Assist countries to enhance participatory governance institutions with a view to making the public administration more open, transparent, accountable, and responsive to citizens in all countries, with particular emphasis on the transition in the Arab region;

(l) Continue activities around the theme of public service delivery and the engagement of citizens in accountability and preventing corruption;

(m) Continue to assist the implementation of the Plan of Action of the World Summit on the Information Society, particularly on e-government, Internet governance and enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet;

(n) Continue to assist in capacity-building and technical cooperation for e-government, including through the further development of the Measurement and Evaluation Tool for E-Government Readiness;

(o) Support capacity-building for archive management, particularly in public administration.

Chapter II
Organization of the session

A. Duration of the session

1. The Committee of Experts on Public Administration, established by the Economic and Social Council in its resolution 2001/45, consists of 24 experts appointed in their personal capacity by the Council upon the nomination of the Secretary-General. The Committee held its tenth session at United Nations Headquarters from 4 to 8 April 2011.

B. Attendance

2. The session was attended by 22 members of the Committee. Observers from organizations of the United Nations system, intergovernmental, non-governmental and other organizations also attended.

3. The session was attended by the following Committee members: Luis F. Aguilar Villanueva (Mexico), Rowena Bethel (Bahamas), Mikhail Dmitriev (Russian Federation), Meredith Edwards (Australia), Walter Fust (Switzerland), Bin Hao (China), Pan Suk Kim (Republic of Korea), Mushtaq Khan (Bangladesh), Francisco Longo Martinez (Spain), Hyam Nashash (Jordan), Peter Anyang' Nyong'o (Kenya), Paul Oquist (Nicaragua), Marta Oyhanarte (Argentina), Odette Ramsingh (South Africa), Siripurapu Kesava Rao (India), Margaret Saner (United Kingdom), Valeria Termini (Italy), Gwendoline Williams (Trinidad and Tobago), Susan L. Woodward (United States of America), Philip Yeo (Singapore), Najat Zarrouk (Morocco), and Jan Ziekow (Germany).

4. Due to administrative responsibilities, the following members could not attend in person: Vitoria Dias Diogo (Mozambique) and Joseph Dion Ngute (Cameroon).

5. The list of observers who attended the session may be viewed on the United Nations Committee of Experts on Public Administration website at http://www.unpan.org/cepa.

C. Agenda

6. The agenda of the Committee for its tenth session was as follows:

1. Election of officers.
2. Adoption of the agenda and other organizational matters.
3. Public governance for results to improve the quality of life for all, by supporting the implementation of the internationally agreed development goals including the Millennium Development Goals:
   (a) Conceptual framework;
   (b) Post-conflict and post-disaster countries;
   (c) Social protection for vulnerable populations.

4. Performance management in governance, including in relation to implementing the internationally agreed development goals and commitments in regard to education, the theme of the 2011 annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council.

5. Review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance.

6. Proposed programme of work and agenda for the eleventh session of the Committee.

D. Election of officers

7. The following members are serving as Committee officers during the current session:

Chair:

Luis **Aguilar Villanueva** (Mexico)

Vice-Chairs:

Walter **Fust** (Switzerland)
Pan Suk **Kim** (Republic of Korea)
Peter **Anyang' Nyong'o** (Kenya)

Rapporteur:

Susan L. **Woodward** (United States of America)

Chapter III
Summary of proceedings and conclusions

A. Work of the Committee

8. At the opening session, Luis Aguilar, Chair of the ninth session, welcomed the experts and observers by noting that the tenth session was an opportunity to renew commitment to the Committee's mandate and that the component on post-conflict and post-disaster countries, including social protection for vulnerable populations, of the current year's theme, public governance for results, deserved the most thoughtful and thorough analysis.

9. Gonzalo Gutierrez Reinel, Permanent Representative of Peru to the United Nations and Vice-President of the Economic and Social Council, gave the first of two introductory speeches. The theme of the Committee's tenth session came at an opportune time when the recession, with rising food prices, unemployment and a decline in social services, are posing special challenges to effective governance and State legitimacy. The United Nations realizes that the close link between public governance and economic development necessitates systematic integration of peace and development to minimize the causes of conflict and social discontent. The results of public governance are visible, for example, in education, which is the theme of the 2011 Annual Ministerial Review. Indeed, the majority of children not attending school live in conflict-affected and fragile States. Additionally, information and communications technologies complement educational skills in translating indigenous processes into local models of sustainable development. The Assistant Secretary-General for Economic Development, Jomo Kwame Sundaram, reiterated that these were challenging times for Governments affected by the financial and economic crisis because such Governments were torn between short-term recovery needs and long-term investment requirements. He added that this was the compelling reason for the Committee's focus on governance, especially better developmental governance. The Assistant Secretary-General revealed that the Under-Secretary-General for Economic and Social Affairs, Sha Zukang, at a recent meeting with finance ministers in Africa, had noted concerns of the Ministers about the neglect of the role of government over the past decades, which had resulted from poor advice from international agencies. He urged the Committee to continue its focus at the ninth session on how to make Governments more responsive to development, including broad citizen engagement. He emphasized that among the challenges to be addressed was that of how to do more with less in the face of budget cuts. Closing remarks on the final day of the tenth session by the Under-Secretary-General reflected on the Committee's discussions and supported its recommendations to the Economic and Social Council on more studies and knowledge-sharing by the Department of Economic and Social Affairs in the field of public administration.

Election of officers

10. The Officer-in-Charge of the Division for Public Administration and Development Management, John-Mary Kauzya, invited nominations for officers of the Bureau for the tenth session. Mr. Dmitriev recommended the reinstatement of incumbents. Ms. Najat, Ms. Ramsingh, Mr. Rao, and Mr. Kim seconded. In the absence of other nominations, the current Bureau was re-elected.

B. Public governance for results

Conceptual and operational framework

11. Elaborating the conceptual framework on public governance for results (E/C.16/2011/2) prepared by Mr. Aguilar, Mr. Longo and Ms. Edwards observed that the concept of government and its analysis were changing substantially. One reason for the change was reaction against the success of the neo-institutional approach of new public management. The other was the reality of an increasingly complex and unpredictable environment in which Governments operate, often with insufficient resources and inappropriate institutions, to face these new challenges, expectations, and tensions. The newer term, governance, no longer referred to public policy alone but to a whole cycle of public policymaking and reflected its change in roles, from hegemonic to facilitating, relational, and cooperative with multiple actors, stakeholders, and methods of accountability in a new era of communication. Market economies and private suppliers of public goods required more regulation, skills such as managing cross-boundary relationships, and rapid adaptation to risks. Furthermore, it was noted that most problems Governments face were global, with inadequate solutions.

12. In assessing results, reconsideration was also required of the priority on efficiency, short-term indicators, and measuring what could be measured quantitatively rather than what matters. What mattered, Mr. Longo explained was to choose criteria prior to choosing indicators — he proposed seven criteria and noted problems to avoid. Examples from Member States reinforced the importance of socially relevant results, measures for objectives that take time to emerge, the independence of evaluations and of the information provided, and that quantitative targets might reduce quality if not also taken into account.

13. Mr. Khan urged for a fundamental rethinking of the nature of governance outside the mature, rule-following Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development countries. He observed that politics and political stability were different in poor countries. He called for country- and region-specific analyses of the social order in which governance takes place to improve results. Mr. Dmitriev concurred, emphasizing that governance for results was an extremely capacity-consuming concept, and added that one should not overemphasize the impact of institutions and rule enforcement where those were weak or ignored and resources were meagre. Mr. Hao stressed the need to include economic issues and the necessity of development in the discussion of good performance in the public sector.

14. Other aspects were debated, including the following: is good leadership more important than institutions where resources and institutional capacity are low? Are there universal principles across countries and regions? Is democracy a precondition of governance for the public good, and if so, does this require citizen education, or do results depend more on who is responsible for recruitment, equipment, training and remuneration of the public service? Does parliament facilitate or obstruct?

Post-conflict and post-disaster countries

15. Ms. Woodward introduced her paper on post-conflict and post-disaster countries contained in the note by the Secretariat (E/C.16/2011/3) by emphasizing that those situations presented qualitatively different challenges, conditions, and requirements than those on which our knowledge and practice on public

administration and governance for results were based. The two categories were lumped together by international organizations and donors precisely because they did not fit conditions for normal aid programmes, calling them crises or emergencies, but, in fact, the challenges those two situations presented were not the same. In addition, countries emerging from war had to deal with a massive battery of donor-defined tasks, programmes, and expectations, which largely bypassed the State or built local capacity for aid delivery and public financial management rather than for peace. By contrast, there were no agreed systematic or coordinated international mechanisms to assist countries facing repeated disasters due to the global environmental crisis and only ad hoc, short-term, and insufficient relief. Assistance to both, however, needed to refocus on development for employment, social welfare and peace.

16. South Africans had learned, Ms. Ramsingh reported, that there were no solutions to reconstructing government and public administration after conflict (and a liberation struggle) that one might propose to post-referendum Southern Sudan now. Rather, ever-widening citizen participation and inclusion in the processes of policymaking and governing would build the trust necessary to sustain it. Technical capacity-building and skills development did not do that. The link between security and peoples' participation should also force a change in international intervention to set boundaries and establish rules of engagement that were acceptable to all.

17. Mr. Oquist began his paper on the environmental crisis and public administration in developing countries by warning that the world was currently in denial about the interrelatedness of those issues, despite growing awareness, and that we were losing valuable time. Issues such as environmental refugees, profound shifts in agricultural yields and crop losses, and loss of habitat, food chains, biodiversity, and food security were only examples of problems so pervasive and big, affecting so many parts of the world — Central America and the Caribbean, sub-Saharan Africa, South Asia — that society itself needed to be mobilized for multiple responses over many years.

18. In regard to post-conflict countries, Mr. Khan argued that inclusion was not enough if resources were insufficient to meet raised expectations among populations. Ms. Edwards asked whether we knew what did and did not work as mechanisms for inclusion. To empower countries in relation to donors, Ms. Saner cited the current Kenyan effort to build skills for negotiating with donors and trade groups. Mr. Nyong'o reinforced the paper's recommendations of simplification and empowering local governments to take the lead in local-level development. Mr. Fust urged the United Nations to end the debilitating effects of frequent turnover on continuity, caused by short-term contracts of three and six months' duration for international staff. As experts on public administration, Mr. Kim added, the Committee needed to provide better ideas for aid effectiveness. Ms. Oyhanarte stressed the need in both post-conflict and post-disaster situations for a professionalized, well-paid public administration with ongoing training and the necessary capacity.

19. In regard to post-disaster countries, Ms. Saner agreed with Mr. Oquist that one could take a proactive approach and that complacency would not help. Ms. Williams noted the common "not in my backyard" message from elites also. Mr. Hao emphasized the importance of preventive strategies and mechanisms already in place to be able to mobilize resources. It was observed that all this needed to be

supported by a legal framework for government to act swiftly. Ms. Termini noted that post-disaster situations well illustrated the new concept of networked governance, where national Governments must build alliances, networks, and links with stakeholders at the international level. Ms. Williams added an emphasis on knowledge management and emotional capital, and Mr. Oquist concluded that the time dimension was important because most transformations took one or two generations to accomplish, not just a few years.

Social protection policies for vulnerable populations

20. Mr. Nyong'o summarized his contribution to the official documents (E/C.16/2011/3) by identifying five types of policies and programmes for social protection, the overriding distinction between those in developed countries and those in developing countries, and the major outstanding question for social protection: why did Governments fail to socially protect even when they had the resources to do so? Successful cases, such as Malawi and Brazil, were the consequence of leadership, suggesting that the answer lay in the interests and ideology of those in power, domestically, since the voices of the vulnerable were never heard at the political level, and internationally, in the ideology of the structural adjustment programmes of the 1980s (though still continuing) of the World Bank.

21. In her discussion, Ms. Williams questioned the role of public administration in that failure, especially in the era of new public management. Perhaps it was the failed policies — macroeconomic and for social protection — but also the constraints on public resources for social protection due to debt repayment obligations, corruption and the mismanagement of resources, and the well-intended but often misguided role of donor agencies.

22. The United Nations had a special role in social protection because of the global commitment through the Millennium Development Goals, the most comprehensive package of social protection policies ever developed by the United Nations system. But poverty, with its consequences for social inequality and conflict, remained pervasive. Mr. Nyong'o asked if that global commitment would continue after 2015. It should consider a global agenda, not just government commitments, comprised of strong international, as well as social, pressure on Governments failing to meet their signed commitments and United Nations assistance to less-resource-endowed Governments who could not. Roberto Villarreal, Chief of the Development Management Branch of the Division for Public Administration and Development Management, shared current work of the United Nations on social protection as two convergent paths: (a) a growing recognition of the risks and contingencies of the development agenda (among them, natural disasters) and specific policies (such as bad macroeconomic policies that caused unemployment) and the search for policies to reduce these risks; and (b) discussions on the severe costs of the financial and economic crisis, including now the food and energy crises, and whether an adequate vulnerability alert system was possible.

23. The papers provoked lively discussion about what particular contribution could be made by experts on public administration to this large and highly specialized, and also highly political, policy issue. Mr. Nyong'o acknowledged that because of its complexity, he focused on two aspects clearly within the Committee's remit: (a) that the implementation of social protection policies was extremely

difficult, requiring substantial capacity and resources and requiring the mobilization of the private sector, civil society and local communities; thus, what did Governments in developing countries choose, where the issue had not been settled by social forces and the nature of the State and where resource- and administrative-capacity constraints were a significant challenge, and why were some effective? (b) what the United Nations should do in the light of its commitment to social protection through the Millennium Development Goals. Ms. Williams noted that in regard to Goals 3, 6, and 7, public administration had given great cause for optimism. The Committee decided, at Mr. Dmitriev's suggestion, to dedicate more time to the drafting of recommendations by convening a working group on social protection. The recommendations should also build on the papers on social protection presented at the ninth session of the Committee of Experts and on a discussion, as Ms. Williams proposed, of the purpose of social protection, which, for Mr. Aguilar, was to build peoples' social capacity to decide on their own future.

24. One reason for complexity, Mr. Khan contributed, was its interlinkages, which made interpreting the data difficult. Mr. Hao illustrated with the correlation identified in China between health and poverty and suggested that medical insurance should be considered a priority for countries focusing on poverty alleviation. For Mr. Kim, the databases lagged behind, relying still on macro indicators rather than on the in-depth statistics which were needed, as provided, for example, in the *African Statistical Yearbook*. Although the State was the most important source of social protection, according to Mr. Hao (although Mr. Kim argued that bigger companies, universities, and hospitals must also share in that responsibility), how best to do so, such as through economic growth or targeted programmes, was hotly debated, as the examples from Australia, Bangladesh and Nicaragua illustrated. Ms. Sehatle requested that the United Nations provide documentation of policies that had worked for poor countries.

25. Parallel to the Committee's discussion on inclusion in post-conflict countries, Mr. Oquist added, was the need to define exclusion, such as those poor who lose their rights to health care and education through the structural adjustment policies of cost recovery. Another source of exclusion was through the privacy of beneficiary rolls, which were a major source of corruption. Ms. Oyhanarte added that public administration should establish public registers of social protection programmes to increase accountability. In the international commitment to intervene to protect vulnerable populations, should there not be more attention to resources for training local expertise to provide that social protection, both to avoid the large international expenses and have a more lasting result?

Working Group on social protection

26. The Rapporteur of the Working Group on social protection, Mr. Dmitriev, announced that the Group's discussions had resulted in a paper that was sufficiently comprehensive on the issues and practical proposals that it should be of great interest to policymakers (see http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/un/unpan045336.pdf).

27. Referring to the paper's section on cash transfers, Mr. Oquist warned against the one-size-fits-all approach because there was a fundamental difference between countries with 8 to 10 per cent poverty and those with 60 to 80 per cent poverty. Concerning corruption, he cautioned that one should consider massive money-

laundering and organized crime, in addition to grand, petty and silent corruption. He also urged for equity in applying standards and implementing controls. Mr. Khan agreed that to talk of corruption in general was not helpful, especially when there was a structural difference between developed and developing countries, namely, that the latter were not always rule-following political systems. Mr. Fust also cautioned that laws on procurement procedures aimed at fighting corruption remained ineffective when some institutions, such as the military and extractive industries, were exempted. Mr. Rao argued with illustrations from India that administrative procedures could reduce the level of corruption in a country. He cautioned, however, that the same administrative procedures could also cause new forms of corruption. Ms. Williams recommended reviewing the United Nations Public Service Awards category on preventing and combating corruption, accordingly. The observer of the Economic Commission for Africa emphasized professionalism in the public service, provoking a long discussion about impartiality versus neutrality. Mr. Khan, Mr. Nyong'o, and Ms. Saner all urged being realistic about what could be achieved in developing countries; rather than aiming at a rule-following, Weberian bureaucracy, there was a need to recognize the daily personal challenge to civil servants to resist corruption, to see professionalism as a process and not an event, and to focus capacity-building for accountability on those areas of corruption that were particularly damaging. Ms. Oyhanarte added the key role of access to information in administrative archives, and Mr. Hao added empowerment through the Internet.

Recommendations for public governance for results in general

28. The United Nations can be an important catalyst and knowledge-broker on what works, when, and why; thus, the Committee recommends to the Secretariat and the Economic and Social Council that they assist Governments in the how, such as through better practice guides, mechanisms for constant monitoring and review, and building organizations with a learning culture.

29. The Committee recommends to the Secretariat and the Economic and Social Council to ensure that the United Nations has the capacity to provide independent information, such as on the Millennium Development Goals, without which independent performance evaluation is not possible.

30. Concerned with the possibility of promoting governance frameworks that may be too costly for, or ill-suited to, a country's conditions, yet may become adopted as a result of citizen and international pressure, the Committee recommends that the Secretariat add sensitivity to national and regional conditions in its advocacy and assistance work.

31. Given the importance of democratic governance to positive results for development, the Committee requests the Secretariat to explore ways that the United Nations can support capacity-building for democracy and a democratic culture in developing countries.

Recommendations for post-conflict and post-disaster countries

32. The character of current international assistance to post-conflict countries requires radical reappraisal to simplify, respect the time necessary for a sustainable peace by multi-year mandates and funds, put local governments in the driver's seat

in choosing priorities in relation to local conditions and move from prescription to facilitation.

33. The Secretariat should develop its capacities to complement ongoing assistance in peace and security, through the Department of Peacekeeping Operations and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), with the crucial (and currently missing) assistance on governance capacities for development, specifically, advice on options and on identifying the civil service positions vital to understanding economic policymaking, training skills for negotiating with donors and trade groups, and assisting public management to support the productive sector, in partnership with the private sector.

34. Programmes of public sector development in post-conflict countries must move from technical assistance provided by expatriate advisers, which creates a parallel civil service without transferring knowledge, to the creation of a locally rooted and professional public administration.

35. International actors intervening in post-conflict countries should rethink concepts of security to recognize its necessary link with broad public participation, the strategic importance of local government, and the imperative of building trust in technical programmes for capacity-building and skills development.

36. The Committee recommends that the Secretariat create an active repository of knowledge of what does succeed, how, and why in post-conflict transitions, including citizen participation in rebuilding the State, an effective civil service, and innovations in public administration, possibly through case studies of the United Nations Public Service Awards.

37. The environmental crisis is not only an issue of climate change but is also a profound threat to development and human security. The Committee urges the Department of Economic and Social Affairs to contribute to an international mechanism for financing adjustments and provide technical support to address agricultural losses and food insecurity. It urges the Division for Public Administration and Development Management to assist countries in the radical restructuring of public administration and development management that is required to meet the challenges of the cumulative impacts of successive disasters.

Recommendations for social protection of vulnerable populations

38. Protecting vulnerable groups should be a priority for any Government, providing social protection within available resources.

39. Criteria for social protection strategies should include: (a) affordability; (b) national values on an ethic of social solidarity; (c) vertical and horizontal equity; (d) support from non-State actors; (e) gender; (f) sustainability over time; (g) the possibility of phasing out when appropriate so as to avoid individual dependency as much as fiscal traps; and (h) administrative efficiency.

40. Special attention should be paid to vulnerable groups currently excluded from mainstream social protection programmes, such as labour migrants, displaced persons, certain minorities such as indigenous peoples, and those denied citizenship where they live.

41. In spite of the United Nations commitment to social protection through internationally agreed goals, including the Millennium Development Goals, and the

work of programmes and agencies such as UNDP, the United Nations Children's Fund, and the World Health Organization, poverty and inequality continue to be pervasive on a global scale. As 2015 approaches, the United Nations should work with Member States to forge a global agenda for social protection, linked more closely with national development agendas beyond the targeted year of 2015.

42. An important contribution to such a global agenda and continuous United Nations involvement is building the capacity of public administrations to implement those goals at the international, national, and local levels.

43. Another contribution would be a global system of knowledge management on the many components of social protection, beginning with an international reference toolkit based on case studies, comparisons, and programme evaluations and an international network on e-services for the disabled and elderly, anchored in the United Nations Public Administration Network (UNPAN).

44. To reduce corruption in social protection programmes and increase accountability, the Committee recommends that public administrations keep public records of the beneficiaries of social programmes.

C. Performance management in governance, including in relation to the theme of the annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council: implementing the internationally agreed goals and commitments in regard to education

45. The financial pressures on budgets worldwide and legitimacy defined by results-based management and responsiveness to citizens have together brought an increasing focus on performance management. In his presentation, Mr. Kim traced its evolution of knowledge and concrete implementation, noting two levels: organizational and individual. He focused on the many systems of incentives and appraisal for individual performance, such as performance agreements, competence models and job descriptions, but performance-related pay is now the most common. Mr. Kim then emphasized the importance of looking beyond theory to practice and why there were reasons to be sceptical about performance-related pay, while a decade of organizational restructuring had created employees more exhausted than empowered, more cynical than self-renewed. More important were standards in training and education on public administration and strong leadership at the head of an organization.

46. Ms. Termini argued in her presentation that individual financial incentives were never sufficient and one must first begin by asking, performance for which socially relevant results? How was social responsibility defined, particularly in the new environment of fragmented responsibility? And what was the role of participation by employees, stakeholders, and citizens? To get professional and motivated civil servants, a positive social environment was necessary. Therefore, education mattered, from early years, in primary school, to create a culture of responsibility and performance orientation and the value of people's well-being. An undervalued tool was also international networking to assist training institutions. In reforming the Italian system for training in public administration and ways to entice the best of the younger generation into public service, she found the Standards of Excellence of the International Association of Schools and Institutes of

Administration a source of inspiration, supplemented by regional sources, European Senior Civil Servant training models and the EuroMed Networks, assisted by the Department of Economic and Social Affairs.

47. A rich discussion on country practices and on difficulties in applying performance assessment followed. Ms. Ramsingh reported that international actors pushed performance contracts on South Africa in 1994, but the quality of the contracts was poor on measurables and ignored their usefulness for and accessibility by citizens. One had to go beyond compliance to action against non-performing departments or ministers, or else confidence in the entire system would erode. Mr. Khan noted the difficulty of assessing performance when individuals were responding to so many parallel audiences and imperatives at once (domestic power groups, donors, service delivery to the poor). Moreover, Mr. Aguilar added that performance was an aggregate result. An observer added that Governments not only perform but also prevent, but one could not measure what has been prevented. The politicization of the bureaucracy, at least in Bangladesh, also raised the question of who would do the assessment. Ms. Nashash questioned whether Governments even considered assessment a priority. The tension between politicians' goals and professional standards and pressure for the civil service to be a tool of a particular regime was cited for Kenya and the Bahamas.

48. Alternatives include the system for promotion and remuneration of civil servants similar to the one in Singapore, where 40 per cent of salary depends on gross domestic product growth, in a business-like manner. The United Kingdom also practices a system that starts with government priorities, then uses a framework for the performance appraisal of each individual, and it goes on through constructive dialogue between managers and staff. At the level of Cabinet, the Prime Minister himself scrutinizes his ministers. In India, Government has introduced specific management targets for individual civil servants, set in consultation with civil society actors. In Pakistan, a UNDP-supported Government programme facilitated a system of performance incentives for police stations (thanas) based on objectives set in collaboration with citizen community boards that have synergies, such as fighting corruption by replacing illicit rents with incentives while being more responsive to community demands.

49. There was wide consensus on the importance of training for better results, particularly in the context of politicized bureaucracies. Mr. Longo stated that achieving positive results requires enormous technical capacities and innovation. Thus, in the end, performance management was fundamentally about the development of good senior managers. Mr. Khan also concluded that one would not get anywhere without highly qualified top bureaucrats who were paid at least in line with private sector pay. Mr. Hao emphasized the importance of a national plan for training linked to the national development strategy. Ms. Zarrouk added that Morocco was establishing a national institute to train civil servants at the local level to accompany decentralization. In support of Ms. Termini's emphasis on building citizenship early, Ms. Oyhanarte shared the Uruguayan experience with the President's Ceibal Plan to give all children a computer. The challenge was how to implement that idea beyond the distribution of computers. Training was done by 200 individuals, mainly young, enthusiastic, filled with pride, and whose success also brought prestige.

Recommendations for performance management

50. Member States need to place priority on training the highest quality senior managers and top civil servants and with pay commensurate with the private sector.

51. Member States need to improve the compensation system for government employees and establish an effective performance appraisal system along with proper job analysis and job description.

52. Member States need to recognize the socially embedded nature of public administrations, and thus the importance of education from an early age on citizenship and a culture of responsibility that values socially relevant results.

53. International organizations and experts should disseminate benchmarking criteria for training institutions, regionally and context-specific, such as a joint effort by the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration, the Department of Economic and Social Affairs, and regional networks.

54. Member States need to construct systems of performance assessment for public administration that engage citizens, such as through community boards and consultation with civil society organizations.

D. Review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance

55. The Chair, Mr. Aguilar, introduced the mandate of the Division for Public Administration and Development Management and regretted the absence of the Division's Director for reasons of health. The Secretariat then presented a note (E/C.16/2011/4) highlighting the major activities it undertook in 2010 and its planned scope of activities and proposed strategic framework for 2012-2013. Its major functional areas of assistance to Governments are analytical research, knowledge-sharing and training, advocacy and partnership-building and advisory services.

56. The three expected outcomes for 2012-2013 are: (a) improved accessibility of information and knowledge-sharing through UNPAN and the United Nations Public Administration Country Studies; (b) enhanced facilitation of dialogue, resolutions and actions on public administration issues effectively supported through improved publications, products, and services; and (c) increased capacity of Governments at the national and local levels to strengthen professionalism, accountability and excellence in the public sector.

57. Achievements in 2010 were: continued work in facilitating implementation of the Tunis Agenda for the World Summit on the Information Society, particularly on e-government, Internet governance and enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet; two publications completed and disseminated: the *United Nations e-Government Survey 2010* and the *World Public Sector Report 2010*;[2] continued knowledge-sharing and training activities through the Secretariat's website (http://www.unpan.org/dpadm), UNPAN, the UNPAN online e-school, and training workshops; capacity-building workshops in Africa, Asia, and Europe;

[2] *World Public Sector Report: Reconstructing Public Administration after Conflict* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.10.II.H.1).

30 advisory missions in 25 countries; a network of African public servants; and a 20 per cent increase in applications for the United Nations Public Service Awards. The technical platform for the United Nations Public Administration Country Studies — a tool for research and sharing to assist Governments in making evidence-based decisions in public administration and a database for analysis by the Division on capacity-building — is near completion for the first phase of content, including public administration codes of conduct and codes of professions to which civil servants may also belong; constitutional rights on citizen engagement; e-government policies, legal frameworks, and strategies; economic and social councils; profiles of chief information officers; and legislation on freedom of information and on data privacy and protection.

58. Committee members congratulated and commended the Secretariat on its accomplishments in 2010 and the impressive scale and scope of its activities, particularly under current resource constraints. Ms. Ramsingh singled out the impressive results of the African Human Resource Network in sharing information, professionalizing the discipline, and improving its image as lowly administration to a critical component of effective governance. Ms. Saner suggested also targeting line managers, as the Commonwealth public administration organ does. Pleased about UNPAN, Mr. Kim was concerned about financing its continuation. Mr. Fust asked about links to the Broadband Commission, the Development Gateway Foundation Inc. of the World Bank and Globethics.net. Mr. Khan warned that the issue was not information but weak enforcement capabilities, so that realistic information and advocacy about countries, whose governance structures were not ideal but managed to solve problems of political and economic development, would be a major contribution. Ms. Bethel was concerned that the message was not coming through that e-government is an enabler to make government better, not just electronics. Members urged the Secretariat to inform them regularly of developments in pursuing their recommendations, through e-mail correspondence and the Secretariat's website.

Recommendations

59. Committee members proposed, in addition to the specific recommendations for each Branch of the Division produced by the working groups, the following recommendations.

60. The Secretariat should present both qualitative and quantitative analysis of the information in Division for Public Administration and Development Management databases, identify explanations for the reality behind those data, and link this understanding more to field advisory services (Ms. Saner). Specifically on open government laws, the data on legal frameworks wrongly assumes that Governments respect their laws (Ms. Oyhanarte). How are gender issues taken into account and are related laws implemented and monitored (Ms. Zarroukh)?

61. The Secretariat should develop a shared activity of capacity-building of the Division for Public Administration and Development Management with the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration, with the aim of promoting concrete action in assisting training institutions in public administration, such as through disseminating tools, good practices and on how to retain good professionals (Ms. Termini; Mr. Hao).

62. In professionalizing senior management, the United Nations should serve as a reference point and promoter, such as sharing the Ibero-America Charter in Latin America, assistance in learning how to cooperate, collaborate, and even be interoperable with the private sector and social organizations (Mr. Longo).

63. The Secretariat should assist training institutions in monitoring and assessing the quality and impact of their performance, possibly through an International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration task force working jointly with the Division for Public Administration and Development Management (Ms. Termini).

64. The Secretariat should compile information on the facts and state of archives and records management and support capacity-building for quality archive management, particularly in public administration (Mr. Fust; Ms. Oyhanarte).

65. The Secretariat should present research findings as options rather than as generalized solutions (Mr. Khan).

66. The Secretariat should view the United Nations Public Service Awards as a rich treasure trove of innovations for use in capacity-building workshops, with line administrators and in partnering with universities (Ms. Williams).

67. The Secretariat should provide information and advocacy on the implementation of regulatory regimes for a market economy (Mr. Rao).

E. Session on innovative ways to enrich collaboration between the Committee of Experts and the Division

68. At the ninth session, the Committee continued the innovation of breaking into working groups defined by the three Branches of the Division. In all three, Committee members sought ways to take advantage of the Committee between annual meetings to facilitate more substantive dialogue among members and closer communication with the Secretariat, such as online or through e-mail.

1. Working group I

Public administration capacity: institutional and human resource development

69. The working group focused discussion on three issues of the Branch's work: restoring public administration in countries emerging out of conflict, including the template for a proposed toolkit, capacity-building for public sector human resource management, most successfully in Africa, and the United Nations Public Service Awards:

(a) Impressed by the Awards, the group recommended that time during Committee meetings be devoted to Awards cases, that its case studies on innovation and what works and why, including the Department of Economic and Social Affairs publication of the winning awards for 2003-2009, be used in capacity-building and training in public administration and also through more partnering with universities, and that the Division write and disseminate a short, simple guide about the awards and application procedures, not only to make the awards better known but also to avoid monopolization by some countries or regions;

(b) Members thought that the idea of a "toolkit on reconstructing public administration after conflict" had much potential, but cautioned that it should not be too prescriptive and for that reason should have a different title, should reflect a diversity of conditions and options, and should be pragmatic, with possible solutions to political leaders and public administrators seeking quick ideas on specific issues. Three additional steps were recommended: make the toolkit more interactive, such as a Wikipedia; convert it into a quasi-network by identifying at least one person personally involved in each case study with whom people can communicate directly about the experience; and do an online survey with those who have gone through these processes for their key pertinent questions.

2. **Working group II**

Development management and citizen engagement

70. The working group focused on the 2011 Branch plan regarding citizen engagement, distinguishing between engagement and participation; on the prevention of corruption; and on access to public information on public service delivery:

(a) The group advised the Branch, given resource constraints, to limit the scope of issues in its analytical work, prioritizing those that seem to offer the greatest impact on the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals, maintaining a balance between research, analysis and advice to countries on policy-making, and being aware of the time-consuming task of keeping the United Nations Public Administration Country Studies updated;

(b) The group explored multiple ways to use citizen engagement to enhance public administration, to use participatory approaches in local government for public service delivery, and to prevent corruption through increased accountability;

(c) Members who attended the 2010 workshop in Barcelona on citizens' engagement remarked on its relevance and quality and also of the follow-up guidelines, and encouraged the Branch to pursue similar efforts in 2011.

3. **Working group III**

E-government development

71. The working group focused on a conceptual discussion of the importance of e-government and the Measurement and Evaluation Tool for E-Government Readiness:

(a) The group recommended that the Committee as a whole support a consensus on the principle that e-government development represents a special opportunity for governments to improve procedures, workflows, and overall efficiency, citizen engagement, and achievement of the Millennium Development Goals. A policy of incentives for its development should be a part of civil service reform. E-government includes mobile communications and is about empowerment as much as electronic technology.

(b) The group recommended stronger connections between the Committee and the Broadband Commission on the same principle of enhancing the effectiveness of public administration, and urged the Department of Economic and

Social Affairs to use its institutional affiliation with the commission to provide additional support to public administration in developing countries;

(c) The group agreed on the importance of the Measurement and Evaluation Tool for E-Government Readiness and its key role as a policymaking tool generating specific outputs, of continuing its support, and of using Committee members through informal contact for its further development;

(d) The group emphasized the indivisible complementarity between the Branch's activities and the Division, warning of the danger of cutting technological aspects off from normative, analytical, and capacity development.

F. Proposed programme of work and agenda for the next session of the Committee of Experts and preliminary review of the draft report of the Committee

72. In 2010, the Committee agreed to adopt a multi-year programme for 2011-2013 on the theme "Public governance for results to improve the quality of human life" with a different subtheme each year. The subtheme for the eleventh session is "How local public administration should be improved to support the implementation of the internationally agreed development goals, including the Millennium Development Goals". Papers will be prepared by selected Committee experts on three topics: intergovernmental governance and regimes; public service capacity-building for local-level development; and transparency, accountability and citizens' engagement.

73. The Committee approved the convening of its eleventh session from 16 to 20 April 2012 and the recommendation of the Chair that there be established procedures for election of the Bureau of the Committee and that elections begin in October to allow for nominations and voting in time for the eleventh session. The Committee agreed to prepare conference papers and discussion each year on an emerging issue and on the theme of the annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council. It also agreed to sustain discussions online and ratify their conclusions, including the elections, via e-mail. The Committee approved the agenda that follows for adoption by the Economic and Social Council:

1. Election of officers.
2. Adoption of the agenda and other organizational matters.
3. Local public governance and administration for results:
   (a) Intergovernmental governance and regimes;
   (b) Public service capacity-building for local-level development;
   (c) Transparency, accountability and citizens' engagement.
4. Review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance.
5. Agenda for the twelfth session of the Committee of Experts.

74. The Committee adopted the draft report of its tenth session.

Annex

List of documents

Document symbol	*Agenda item*	*Title or description*
E/C.16/2011/1	2	Provisional agenda and organization of work
E/C.16/2011/2	3	Public governance for results: a conceptual and operational framework
E/C.16/2011/3	3	Public governance for results: State capacity for post-conflict and post-disaster reconstruction and social protection policies
E/C.16/2011/4	5	Review of the United Nations Programme in Public Administration and Finance

11-32084 (E) 160511

Please recycle